

India's Position on Multi-stakeholderism vs Multilateralism

2011

6th Internet Governance Forum (IGF),
Nairobi/
UN General Assembly Meeting (UNGA),
New York City

ATTENDED BY Dushyant Singh, Ministry of
External Affairs (MEA) - proposed Committee
on Internet-related Policies (CIRP)

MULTILATERAL

2012

7th IGF, Baku

ATTENDED BY Kapil Sibal, Minister for
Communications and Information
Technology (MCIT)*

Department of
Telecommunications (DoT)
Department of Electronics and
Information Technology (DeitY)

MULTI-STAKEHOLDER

*As Sibal was minister for both, DoT and DeitY, it
cannot be confirmed which department within the
Ministry he was speaking on behalf of

World Conference on International
Telecommunications, Dubai

ATTENDED BY R.N. Jha, DoT

MULTI-STAKEHOLDER

They did not allow national security to
become an excuse to deploy an Internet kill
switch.

UNGA resolution creates a
Working Group on Enhanced
Cooperation (WGEC)

2013

8th IGF, Bali

ATTENDED BY Rakesh M. Agarwal, DoT

MULTI-STAKEHOLDER

WGEC PHASE I

2nd WGEC Meeting, Geneva

ATTENDED BY B.N. Reddy, MEA

NUANCED MULTILATERALISM

Stated that Enhanced Cooperation is a multilateral
mechanism but called for a MS approach solely to
enhance dialogue and discussion with policy making
upto Governments only.

2014

NETmundial, Sao Paulo

ATTENDED BY Vinay Kwatra, MEA

MULTILATERAL

Internet governance should be "multilateral
..... with the participation of governments,
private sector, civil society, and international
organizations, in their **respective roles**".
Language similar to the CIRP proposal.

Called for internationalisation of structures
that manage and regulate core Internet
resources

India's contribution did not use the word
'multi-stakeholder' in its approach apart from
describing the IGF.

3rd WGEC Meeting, Geneva

ATTENDED BY B.N. Reddy, MEA

NUANCED MULTILATERALISM

Multi-stakeholder models were useful in public policy
formulation but not in their implementation and
enforcement. Governments have sovereign public
policy function over Internet-related public policy issues
relating to coordination and management of critical
Internet resources, as well as specific issues such as
cyber-security and child online protection.

9th IGF, Istanbul
ATTENDED BY R.S. Sharma, DeitY

NUANCED MULTILATERALISM

DeitY's stance moves in favour of a more nuanced and narrowed support for multi-stakeholderism.

4th WGEC Meeting, Geneva
ATTENDED BY B.N. Reddy, MEA

MULTILATERAL

"India was not opposed to multi-stakeholderism, but needed greater clarity"
MEA's statements at the meeting may be interpreted as accepting changes in stakeholder roles *only if and when* governments are willing to permit such change; this is in opposition to the view of multi-stakeholder advocates.

International Telecommunication Union (ITU) Plenipotentiary Conference, Busan
ATTENDED BY Ram Narain, DoT

MULTILATERAL

Working Group on International Internet-Related Public Policy, Geneva

ATTENDED BY DoT

MULTILATERAL

India reiterated that the management of the Internet should be "*multilateral, transparent, and democratic*" with the key institutions regulating the Internet needing to be internationalized

2015

10th IGF, João Pessoa
ATTENDED BY Rahul Gosain, DeitY

NUANCED MULTILATERALISM

2016

DeitY and DoT were part of the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MCIT). In 2016, these both were subsumed within the newly created Ministry of Communications and Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology (MeitY).

11th IGF, Mexico
ATTENDED BY Aruna Sundararajan, DoT
Rahul Gosain, MeitY
No relevant comments were given

2017

12th IGF, Geneva
ATTENDED BY Rahul Gosain, MeitY
No relevant comments were given
This should not be surprising given their continuous frustration with the perceived lack of progress at various IGF's.

WGEC PHASE II

2nd WGEC 2.0 Meeting, Geneva

NUANCED MULTILATERALISM

2018

Working Group on International Internet-Related Public Policy, Geneva

ATTENDED BY Kishore Babu, DoT

MULTI-STAKEHOLDER

Clear in their support for the multi-stakeholder form of internet governance stating that India was in favor of governments having "*equal footing in IG with involvement of stakeholders*".

3rd WGEC 2.0 Meeting, Geneva

ATTENDED BY Pradeep Verma, MeitY

NUANCED MULTILATERALISM

"WGEC should encourage all stakeholders to come forward, participate, and make their voices be heard in the formulation of public policies pertaining to the Internet."

4th WGEC 2.0 Meeting, Geneva

ATTENDED BY Bhavna Saxena, MEA

NUANCED MULTILATERALISM

While debating a proposal regarding policy making at local and national levels, India made it clear that they do not support this. They believe it is in the best interests of everyone to *"confine ourselves to the international platforms on Internet policy making"*.

5th WGEC 2.0 Meeting, Geneva

ATTENDED BY Rahul Gosain, MeitY

Bhavna Saxena, MEA

No relevant comments were given